

## **Why don't Hanafis say 'Ameen' out loud?**

[http://www.muftisays.com/blog/Seifeddine-M/1563\\_18-05-2011/why-don%27t-hanafis-say-%27ameen%27-out-loud%3F-.html](http://www.muftisays.com/blog/Seifeddine-M/1563_18-05-2011/why-don%27t-hanafis-say-%27ameen%27-out-loud%3F-.html)

### Question:

What is the proof in the Hanafi school for not saying ameen loudly after fatiha (in congregational prayers), especially in light of hadiths that say we should (such as whoever's ameen coincides with that of the angels, all his sins are forgiven, etc)?

### Answer:

In the Name of Allah, Most Gracious, Most Merciful

Walaikum assalam wa rahmatullah,

There is nothing to indicate that one say the Ameen out loud in this hadith, as the Hanafi scholars explain. This was the position of major Companions of the Messenger of Allah (Allah bless him and give him peace), including Ibn Mas`ud (Allah be pleased with him), who said, **'Four things are said quietly by the imam,' and he mentioned the ameen among them.** [Marghinani, Hidayah]

**And given that Ameen is a dua, the basis is that it be said quietly.** [Jassas, Ahkam al-Qur'an, 3.238; ibid.] In this regard, it is akin to the other duas and dhikrs of the prayer: *they are said quietly (unless they relate to moving from one posture to another)*. To establish that it is to be said aloud would require clear proof.

The hadiths that mention the Companions hearing the Ameen of the Messenger of Allah (Allah bless him and give him peace) are understood to be because he either whispered it so it was audible to *those near* or that he said it loud for *instructional purposes*. Imam Daraqutni (ra), one of the great hadith verifiers said that *there is no established hadith from the Prophet (Allah bless him and give him peace) on saying it out loud.* [Ibn al-Humam, Fath al-Qadir, 1.291-292]

The Maliki school's position on this issue is like the Hanafi position. [Dardir, al-Sharh al-Saghir, 1.327]

And Allah alone gives success.

Wassalam, Faraz Rabbani