

## Is prayer of men and women the same in Saheeh Bukhari?

<http://www.muftisays.com/forums/27-sharing-portal/7441-is-prayer-of-men-and-women-the-same-in-saheeh-bukhari.html>

### Matter of dispute:

The Madkhalees make the argument that the prayer of men and women is the same as it is categorically stated in Authentic Hadeeth that Sayyidina Rasul-ullah (Sallaho Alaihe Wassallam) stated:

### Pray as you have seen me Pray...

Since he didn't make any distinction in this Hadeeth it equally applies to men or women the same way. Instead of presenting one part of the Hadeeth lets produce the full text from Saheeh Bukhari:

### Hadeeth:

قال الوهاب عبد حدثنا : قال المثنى بن محمد حدثنا  
إلى أتينا مالك حدثنا : قال قلابة أبي عن أبي وب حدثنا  
م تقاربون شدة ورحمة وسلم عليه الله صلى النبي  
الله رسول وكان ليلة يوم عشرين عنده فاقمنا  
قد أناظن في لمارف يقارديما وسلم عليه الله صلى  
بعدنا تركنا عن سألنا أشدنا قد أو أهلنا أشدنا  
فيهم في أفيموا يكمأهل إلى ارجعوا قال في أخذ برناه  
وصلوا أذفظها لا أو أذفظها أشياء وذكر ومروهم وعلموهم  
لكم في ليؤذن الصلاة حضرت في إذا أصلي رأي تموني كما  
أذبركم ول يومكم أذدكم

Narrated Malik (RA): We came to the Prophet (Sallalloho Alaihe Wassallam) and stayed with him for twenty days and nights. We were all young and of about the same age. The Prophet (Sallalloho Alaihe Wassallam) was very kind and merciful. When he realized our longing for our families, he asked about our homes and the people there and we told him. Then he asked us to go back to our families and stay with them and teach them (the religion) and to order them to do good things. He also mentioned some other things which I have (remembered or) forgotten. The Prophet then added, "Pray as you have seen me praying and when it is the time for the prayer one of you should pronounce the Adhan and the oldest of you should lead the prayer. [Bukhari]

### **Circumstances & Commands in the Hadeeth:**

There are (4) things to note in this Hadeeth:

1. These were a group of men (*no women*) who had the blessed opportunity of staying in the company of Sayyidina Rasul-ullah (Sallallahu Alaihe Wassallam)
2. They were **ORDERED** to pray like Sayyidina Rasul-ullah (Sallallahu Alaihe Wassallam)
3. They were **ALSO ORDERED** to call the Adhaan
4. They were **ALSO ORDERED** for the oldest one to lead the prayer

### **Madkhali selective interpretation of the Hadeeth:**

1. If the prayer of the women is the same as men according to this Hadeeth then:
  1. How come it is NOT OBLIGATORY OR SUNNAH on women to call the Adhan with every prayer?
  2. How come it is NOT OBLIGATORY OR SUNNAH on the oldest women to become Imam in every prayer?

### **Do other Narrations restrict Adhan and becoming Imam for women?**

If the Madkhali response is that other Ahadeeth restrict calling the Adhan and leading the prayers for women then we say that other Ahadeeth also state that **the method of prayer for women is different to men as explained in detail here.**